

CHILI TOWN BOARD
October 12, 2016

A meeting of the Chili Town Board was held on October 12, 2016 at the Chili Town Hall, 3333 Chili Avenue, Rochester, New York 14624 at 7:00 p.m. The meeting was called to order by Supervisor David Dunning.

PRESENT: Councilman DeCory; Councilman Slattery, Councilwoman Sperr and Supervisor David Dunning. Councilman Brown was excused.

ALSO PRESENT: Dawn Forte, Supervisor's Secretary; Sandra Hewlett, Stenographer; Virginia Ignatowski, Town Clerk; Daniel Knapp, Director of Finance; David Lindsay, Commissioner of Public Works/Highway Superintendent; Councilman Slattery, Deputy Town Supervisor; Richard Stowe, Counsel for the Town; Eric Vail, Insurance Counselor.

The invocation was given by Virginia Ignatowski.

The Pledge of Allegiance was cited. The fire safety exits were identified for those present.

PUBLIC HEARING

A Public Hearing was held by the Chili Town Board on October 12, 2016 at the Chili Town Hall, 3333 Chili Avenue, Rochester, New York 14624 at 7:00 p.m. to discuss the 2017 Budget. Hearing to consider the following:

Water District Assessment Rolls (Hynes Tract, S. Chili Benefit Area #2)
Sewer Districts (Chili Sewer Improvement Benefit Area #1)
Consolidated Lighting District #1
Lighting Districts (Chili Industrial, Pumpkin Hill, Blueberry Hill, Parklands of Chili)
Sidewalk Districts (Park Place, Vistas at the Links)
Park District (Lexington)
Consolidated Drainage District
Assessment Rolls for Fire and Fire Protection Districts (Chili, Gates-Chili, Clifton, Chili, Scottsville)
Assessment Rolls for Ambulance Districts (Chili, Gates-Chili, Clifton, Chili, Scottsville)
Proposed contracts for Ambulance Districts
Proposed contracts for Fire and Fire Protection Districts
Preliminary Budget 2017

Attendance as previously noted in the 10/12/16 Chili Town Board meeting minutes.

COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS FROM THE AUDIENCE:

DOROTHY BORGUS, 31 Stuart Road

MS. BORGUS: Unfortunately, I didn't get a copy of the budget until yesterday. I kept looking for it on the website and it wasn't there. But I have had time the last two days to -- to look it over and it isn't the small things that bother me about the budget. Actually, when it comes down to calculators and office supplies and specialty forms and all that, it's a good budget. There is not much change.

But it is the big things that drive me buggy. To begin with, I'll start with attorney. That's account 1420. 01420.4150. These numbers are right from Town records, all of them. The actual expense for 2014 was 100 -- \$116,649.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Dorothy (Borgus), I'm sorry. Do you know what page you're on?

MS. BORGUS: Let me look.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Page number at the top.

MS. BORGUS: Let me just look.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Our books are not separated by departments.

DANIEL KNAPP: 23.

MS. BORGUS: 23.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Page 23?

MS. BORGUS: Uh-huh.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Dan (Knapp) knows these numbers off the top of his head, so.

MS. BORGUS: The actual for 2014, as you can see, in the total column line was \$116,649.

The actual for 2015 was a little over \$101,000.

And to date, in 2016, it was \$67,052.

But then I look at the budget. The preliminary budget total. 149,775 -- just shy of

\$150,000. I don't know how you can look at past numbers and think that that is going to be the amount we spend. In looking at the detail of it, you can see the big item in this is the attorney for labor relations. But again, go back to the actual figures. The actual for 2014 was -- for sake of rounding, \$7,600.

For 2015, it was \$5,600.

And to date for 2016 is \$3,400, but the budget is \$25,000.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Dorothy (Borgus), it's a contract year. Those years that you're mentioning were not contract years. There were no contract negotiations going on so the expenses paid in those years were for things, whatever labor issues might have arisen in that timeframe. But if you go back to contract years, you will see this is very consistent with what we budgeted for a year we're negotiating contracts, which I think the last year we did that is 2012.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: It's usually higher in a contract year.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: 2011/2012 time frame, so you would have to go back further to the previous budget to kind of get that real relationship there. But contract negotiations, as you know takes a little bit more attorney power than normal.

MS. BORGUS: Is this the Union contract for all Town employees that are --

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: All Union.

MS. BORGUS: -- that are union members?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Yes.

MS. BORGUS: The other thing I would like to talk about is the interfund transfers and that is 019901.900. I will give you a page if I have one here.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Waiting to see if Dan (Knapp) beats you.

DANIEL KNAPP: 59.

MS. BORGUS: 59.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Go ahead.

MS. BORGUS: What I would have a question about -- well, two actually. The capital improvement for admin -- I think that is administrative building reserve. Why would that be so high at \$275,000? It's item 4.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I'm sorry, capital improvement?

MS. BORGUS: Uh-huh. Why is -- why is that so high?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: It's one of --

MS. BORGUS: What are you anticipating, I guess, is the question.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Sometimes we -- we just don't know. And we are going to be making some -- planning some interior renovations of the building to make it more user friendly, if you will. We -- we have discussed and Mr. Lindsay is working on plans right now to adjust the entrances to the Building Department so that you don't have to walk all of the way to the end to get to the Building Department, especially with seniors, and the same with the Assessor's Office. We want to relocate how that is to make it more user friendly. We don't know what the cost would be at this point in time. So that reserve, we tend to put money in those reserves to take care of things like that.

Other things around the building, roofs, heating -- the building, it was built in 1998. It's still a nice looking building, but there are things we don't know -- windows, roof, again, heating, cooling. We spent a fair amount of money trying to mess with some of the HVAC system to try to balance some things out. That is basically what that money is set in there for.

And it's a reserve, again -- not to mention any other municipalities, but it is one thing that we try to make sure that our reserves are healthy so that we don't run into situations where -- where we don't have money to fix something if we need it.

MS. BORGUS: Wasn't that the original plan? I know it was the original plan. That was not a question when this building was built, that that would be a contractor's entrance at the end of the building. That was always the plan.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: We're not talking about that particular entrance. What I'm referring to is the plan that we're working at right now, looking at, in the Building Department specifically, you know how you have to walk down the hall to get to the door where the residents come in, we want to move it over to this end of the building, so it is in the center cross hallway so that residents don't have to walk all of the way down, closer to the Town Clerk's Office.

Same with the Assessor's Office. We're looking at moving it to another location right up front where the Finance Office is now so that residents and -- and I will say specifically seniors who frequent these areas, um, don't have to walk all of the way down the end of the hall to get to something. We can put the Finance Office and IT back -- and they're healthy, they can walk a little further.

MS. BORGUS: The other question I have on that account is the Recreation Building Reserve, which is Item 1 on that list, I see it was originally slated to be \$400,000 and it's been reduced to -- on the preliminary budget to \$332,000. Again, what is the thinking there?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: The thinking there is the building we're currently in is in dire need of some type of repairs. We have been putting off the roof for at least six, maybe eight years that I'm aware of. The roof on that building has been kind of on the -- on the verge of going. I believe also there was an issue, correct me if I am wrong, Mr. Lindsay, but I think there was an issue with the heating there also.

DAVID LINDSAY: Yes.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Very expensive repair. Roof alone would probably eat up most of that money. So that is what we're looking at there, is being prepared if we do have to absolutely do it, that we can do it.

MS. BORGUS: Okay. Thank you.

The next one I wanted to look at was contingency. That is 011990.4000. Now, I fully understand the need to have a contingency fund. Things come up and you can't count on everything. We don't have crystal balls.

I also think, though, that it ought to be somewhere in the realm of reality how much we -- we -- we plan on to leave there as a -- a nest egg, if you will. Looking back, and I actually have gone back to 2012, and the actual in that account was -- that was spent was zero.

2013, it was zero.

2014, it was zero. But it was budgeted at \$60,000.

In 2015, it was still zero for expense. It was still budgeted at \$60,000.

To date, for 2016, by the papers, the report there -- the budget that was printed that was on the website, it is still zero for -- so far for this year as of September 14th. It is still budgeted -- but it was still budgeted at \$60,000. \$60,000 is a -- a reasonable amount of money to set aside in case you have a problem. We're okay this far.

But the 2017 budget I see is \$130,000, up 216 percent from the prior budget. Why?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I'm going -- Dan (Knapp) --

DANIEL KNAPP: I will let you talk to the 130, but I just want to address the fact that all of the expenses are zero. This account per State -- the State sets up the -- the chart of the accounts and the accounts we use here. This one here is purely a budgetary account. What happens over the course of the year, again, this is contingency. We have a need somewhere else that we need to move that money to so what we do is we actually take the budget funds out of here and move it to that account. We're not allowed to actually ever expense anything in this particular account.

So if I needed \$2,000 of some unforeseen equipment in a different account, I would do -- we would have through Town Board resolution, resolution to move the \$2,000 out of here into another. So -- so if you go back through history, you will always see \$0 of actual expense in this particular account.

MS. BORGUS: What are your debits and credits then? How did you accomplish that? If no matter what you take out, it will show a zero?

DANIEL KNAPP: If we start off with a budget of 60,000 and I need \$2,000 somewhere else, I take 2,000 out of here and I add it to the budget in whatever other account.

MS. BORGUS: Then there is no record in this account you removed it.

DANIEL KNAPP: What you end up seeing here is an adjusted budget at the end of the year of \$58,000 in that particular instance. You would have to look -- when you look at the adjusted budget for this particular account, at the end of each year, that is how you actually figure out how much we spent. Which for the previous years that's not on here.

MS. BORGUS: But on this account to date you haven't used anything of that account, because --

DANIEL KNAPP: In this -- where is it here?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I believe --

DANIEL KNAPP: If you look, it says \$56,900 is the adjusted budget for 2016, so that means we actually used \$3,100. We moved that \$3,100 to another account that needed it.

MS. BORGUS: All right. So how do we explain \$130,000?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: The 130 -- please correct me if I am wrong, but wasn't that set aside for the equipment, the grant money -- am I missing that one?

DANIEL KNAPP: Negotiations.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Oh, yes. Thank you. It was our -- I don't know how much of this I can say. It was -- it was set aside for perhaps anticipation of monies that may be needed for contract negotiations, not attorney fees but for actual, um, expenses that may be related to -- I don't know -- I'm struggling with this because some of this is confidential labor relations and labor contract -- it -- the money is set aside to perhaps provide additional compensation through our concessions in our labor negotiations. I don't know how else to better say that without giving the details.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Supervisor, you can provide more details later if that is okay, Dorothy (Borgus), once he gets past the point he can talk about it.

MS. BORGUS: Still tied up with this Union thing?

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Possibly.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Yes. What happens with the Board -- what happens with the Union, once the negotiations -- when we get to the point the Union agrees on the terms, if you will, they go to ratification and the Union membership will then vote.

After the Union membership votes, the Town Board has to convene and vote to approve the terms of the contract.

Once the Town Board does that, then we'll know if or what we need out of that account to pay for whatever compensation we're providing inside the contract.

MS. BORGUS: When does this contract take effect if it is passed and ratified?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: If it's ratified tomorrow and the Town Board meets on Friday to --

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Just an example.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: This is an example. This is not happening. This is not the way it works. But hypothetically -- thank you -- if it was to happen that way, then this would be 2017.

MS. BORGUS: Okay.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: That it would take effect.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Dorothy (Borgus), I think over the years I've been involved here, over the last 15 years we have stayed within the range that is recommended for a contingency account. I think we have always been in that realm. The other thing I would add to that, I don't think I ever want to see the Town in the position it was back in 1992 when we had the -- was it '92 with the Ice Storm? '91 for the Ice Storm, and then the '92 year they had to raise the taxes by like 20 percent or something like that. So -- so I don't want to ever see us in that position. So I think we do a pretty good job with that.

MS. BORGUS: Just a 216 percent increase kind of gets your attention.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: I can see why you would. Oh sure. Oh sure.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: And percentages are real good, too. When you look at percentage, you hear -- you talk about, well, 100 percent goes up -- in a \$10,000 account for 50,000, 100 percent, so it -- I'm just -- I don't like playing with the numbers either and just throwing those out, certain figures. We're -- I think we have done our due diligence over the years, Dorothy (Borgus), the years that I have been on this Board to cutting the budget, scaling back and asking the great questions that we come up with during the budget process.

And for the folks that are sitting in the audience that aren't aware, this Town Board holds budget meetings two nights. The public is more than welcome to come. Actually nobody from all of Chili, the 29,000 people that we have in this community, attend either one of those budget nights that we have the departments heads come in, we have a list of questions that we ask them over and over. I --

Dorothy (Borgus), you know me and my history. I have a spreadsheet that I keep ever since I was elected in 1999 of every budget I have been associated with, looking at every line that is in there, and -- and I would invite this -- the public, the community to come out to these budget hearings where it is more in depth, more nuts and bolts, talking with each department head from the Library to the Highway Department to the Recreation Department, Senior Center, the Fire Department. We -- we talk to each one of them, and we ask them the hard questions.

And tonight you're just getting a very small piece of what goes into this very large budget that we're looking at and speaking of tonight. So I would invite people to come to these meetings. It's very informative. You get a better handle of it instead of just listening to now, just a little bit of it. So I would welcome that.

But, Dorothy (Borgus), once again I thank you for your -- I know you go through this budget --

MS. BORGUS: Thoroughly.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: -- very thoroughly and I appreciate your time that you do it.

MS. BORGUS: I have been to those meetings, though, Mike (Slattery), and the problem is -- maybe it's better since you got the overhead. I have been to them for years but the last couple I haven't, because you're given nothing. I mean everything -- everybody has their paperwork up on the dais and they know what is going and you sit there and you haven't got a clue, not a clue.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: It's been a few years since you have been.

MS. BORGUS: I haven't been here in two years because I got tired of having to go buy my own budget.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: We stopped using the overhead because of that, there is no one else there in attendance.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: We're prepared to use the overhead if people do attend.

MS. BORGUS: If it can be read from out here. The overhead is as good -- I mean you can only do so much -- maybe it is easy when you have a screen in front of you. When you sit out here, it is pretty hard to read.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: We actually sit down below. But with the screen overhead. We took your comments that you brought to us a few years ago and we're prepared to do that.

MS. BORGUS: Of the years I did come and I knew what was going on and I would make notes, I was going out and spending my own money to get a budget printed of 100 plus pages so I knew what was going and -- and after a while you just don't keep that up. But it is nice when it is on the computer. It is still hard to read and a little time would have been better rather than rushing like I did.

Now I want to talk about equipment. Most of which is in account 02.5130.2000. I can give you the page, I think. 63. I understand that Mr. Lindsay was good enough to get back to me today and tell me what number 62 is.

Again, it's always -- it's hard for a -- the -- a taxpayer to look at this and see that replace Number 1, replace Number 6, replace number 62. What is that?

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: I agree with you. From a Town Board member's standpoint, we don't have a clue either. That is why during the budget process when we met with him, we asked him all that.

MS. BORGUS: Again --

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: I know you weren't here, so I --

MS. BORGUS: I was probably one of many, many, many, many people who weren't here either.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: 29,000 of them.

MS. BORGUS: It would be nice in the future if those -- if that -- you know, a little

parentheses after each one and identify what it is.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Good -- good point, Dorothy (Borgus).

MS. BORGUS: Now, then in addition to that, um, in the Parks budget -- I don't know if I have that one with me -- I don't think I do. But there was equipment there for another 88 -- I'm sorry, 85,800.

In the highway, as you can see, the -- we started out with 603,000. Add that together, and that's \$688,800 for equipment. And before everybody jumps on me about how that is reserve money and grants, you know what? It doesn't matter. It is still equipment and it's what it costs. And that reserve money is just the taxpayers' money in a different pocket. It is still the taxpayers' money and it is still cost. And I've seen these equipment numbers high before, but I've never seen them that high.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: We did hold off on a purchase last year that is put in this year. And I have a note that I wrote down "no purchase if no grant money." So there is equipment on here that we're only purchasing if we receive the grants.

MS. BORGUS: Right. I appreciate that, but it is still -- even take that out, I mean -- normally -- normally the Town seems to go around 600, \$625,000. That's still a lot of money for a Town the size of Chili that repeatedly does this every year. This isn't a one-time thing. This isn't a big bump like your attorney bill or your -- your contingency fund. This is every year we do this.

Multiply that by ten, and you can appreciate the magnitude of what we spend on equipment. I mean, I have never seen \$688,800 in one year. Never.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: So, Dorothy (Borgus), you're referring to a mower?

MS. BORGUS: Mowers, I believe it was two -- I don't -- I don't have that sheet with me. I didn't copy the whole budget. It was 127 pages.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: There was a large mower being replaced and a smaller mower.

MS. BORGUS: I think that's right. It should come to \$85,800.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Uh-huh.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: They're big mowers.

MS. BORGUS: That's all right. I understand and they mow a lot. They do a lot of cutting. It isn't that. It is just that that total is stunning when it is every year.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Then call the vendor and ask them to reduce it for us.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Dorothy (Borgus), let me break it down for you a little bit. To replace a dump truck, it is \$242,000.

MS. BORGUS: I see that.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: But, Dorothy (Borgus), when you do it that way, it puts it in perspective what does that \$600,000 get us. They're not sitting out there with the sheets in front of them. So under equipment. 33,000, another 33,000. Those are trucks. Number 62 that you mentioned is \$185,000.

MS. BORGUS: Which is a dump truck.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: When you break it down by individual, there only five pieces of equipment on there so it's not a lot.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: But is it a dump truck that has a plow attachment to it and especially during the winter storm that we get, that they're ready to lynch people because the roads aren't being plowed and we can't keep up with the snow. We need the equipment to be able to go out and do that.

I would ask the community, how do you like Chili's roads? Drive into another community, our neighboring community and then compare our roads. You see, I'm getting a thumbs-up because the people really appreciate the service that our guys, the women -- men and women that work for this Town, the service that they provide. They need the equipment to do it.

And believe me, this is one conservative Town Board here, and I'm -- I'm one of the first ones. Mr. Lindsay, my wife told me to leave the poor guy alone because I keep going after him about different things. And she -- she sent him a sympathy card because he has to deal with me.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: She never sent me one.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: She sent it to me for dealing with you.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: One of the things I also think that needs -- needs to be understood is what you see, what all of you see on the road, looks like very nice, clean, shiny, sparkling vehicles. Some of those vehicles are very old and we spend a lot of time and energy and touching up, sanding and grinding and hand-painting to make -- keep the trucks looking nice. So we don't -- you drive around and look at other municipalities and you see a lot of rust buckets out there. You see things just don't look nice. Ours look nice because we try to make them look nice.

We intentionally do that so when they go to auction -- we'll speak more to this in a little bit, but when they go to auction, we get the best value for our vehicles, for the return back on our vehicles.

Also, we move these vehicles -- and Mr. Lindsay, please if you would like -- we try to move and cycle these vehicles through at their best value. We have to look at the repair costs, where we are with those and when the best value to turn over that vehicle is. Um, and -- and it turns out, for the most part, you know, around that 10-to-12-year timeframe is when most of these vehicles -- we try to stretch them out if we could, but what risk do you want -- would you rather us put in \$50,000 repairs in a truck --

MS. BORGUS: I haven't seen the repair records. When I get one of those minutes that

everybody is looking for, I'm going to go look at them.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: There are maintenance records on all of our vehicles, Dorothy (Borgus), and I think you will find that our trucks are very well kept and kept up. But again, we want to make sure that we're maintaining the best value when we go to market to sell these vehicles.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: And actually, the one dump truck we're replacing is a 2002. And the -- people, think about your own vehicles. What really causes problems? It's the rust. Salt. What are these trucks carrying all winter long? Salt. So think about that for -- from that aspect. It's a 2002 that is out going certain times of the year, that thing is going probably, you know, 16, 18, 20 hours a day, you know, just trying to keep up with the snow with different drivers. So this -- you got to keep it in perspective what these trucks are being utilized for.

And then in the summertime they're out hauling stone. They're hauling asphalt. They're hauling leaves, that type of thing. So these trucks aren't just sitting around four, five days a week. They're out there being utilized. That's what they're there for. They're going out in some tough conditions, so keep it in perspective. I know it's a lot of money. Believe me. I deal with it on a daily basis.

MS. BORGUS: It's the most. I thought I have seen the top number.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: The costs aren't going down, Dorothy (Borgus).

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: That is what I was going to say.

MS. BORGUS: I appreciate that. I do. But on the other hand -- I would -- it would be interesting to look at another Town and see if they replace equipment as much as we do. And if it is breaking down and really costing a lost money, sure, that is like your car. You get rid of it because you would rather pay on a new one than on a repair, but I would like to see the proof that these are costing this much money.

And as far as resale value goes, I didn't bring the sheets in because, as I say, I wasn't going to copy 120 some pages of budget. But it looked to me like the resale value on those was very minimal.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Dorothy (Borgus), I will touch on it really quick now. The County just had their auction. People were spending stupid money on used vehicle equipment, vehicles at that auction. They were spending above the Blue Book value for the equipment. And I was there and I just couldn't believe it. That's why I'm looking forward to hearing what Mr. Lindsay has to say later about the auction, because some of the stuff they were selling, it blew my mind. You could go out and buy something new for the price they were paying for something.

MS. BORGUS: That's the problem with an auction.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: It's a good problem for us, though. If you get carried a way, we love it.

MS. BORGUS: We hear figures in here --

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: David (Lindsay), can you share with us what you did find at this point? Let's nip that right now.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: And hopefully I didn't put my foot in my mouth.

DAVID LINDSAY: We sent a number of vehicles to the fall auction. I will give you a sampling here. I won't read through all of them. One was a plow truck, a number 88, 2002 vehicle. So again, it was at 14, 15 years old and we received about \$32,000 back for that. Which is, you know, talking to the auction house, that is some really good return on our investment, the vehicle we had. It's a 14-year-old vehicle.

Another one that we had there, 2003 dump truck, a six-wheel. We got about \$16,000 for that one.

A 2008 F-250, we got 13,300, so that is about half -- that's about a 50 percent return on that one considering what we bought it for.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: What year?

DAVID LINDSAY: 2009.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Yeah.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Dorothy (Borgus), we did learn there are towns that actually every couple years trade vehicles in and they make money on the vehicles because they buy them on State bid. But keep in mind, we don't borrow money for these vehicles, so we are not paying interest on that. We have a reserve fund and a rotation circle so we can pay cash for those. You save money that way.

MS. BORGUS: A reserve fund is a wonderful idea, but you would just hate to think the taxpayers, if they took time to look at this budget, which probably 99.9 percent won't, they think as long as it doesn't appear as an expense in the preliminary budget for this year, as long as it's reserve money, it's not their money. But it is our money.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: It is our money. It is my money.

MS. BORGUS: We're taking it out of another pocket so it is not showing up in that column and it looks like nothing. Well, it's not. It is still our money. It's like people say the State will give it for you or buy it. It's still our money.

Now I want to look ---

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Every time they give grant money, I will take it.

MS. BORGUS: Grant money is one thing.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: That's still taxpayer money. Still our money.

MS. BORGUS: Somehow it probably is, but reserve is blatantly our money.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: There is no somehow.

MS. BORGUS: Now I want to look at mortgage tax revenue. 01.3005. Let me see if I can find the page for you.

DANIEL KNAPP: 10.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Page 10.

MS. BORGUS: Page 10. You're right.

I went back and looked at the actual income, and actually, I -- I even went back to 2012. Not only the records that I was given yesterday, but on the computer, I went back in my old budgets and found it.

In 2002, and I will round these just -- because these numbers can get mind-numbing after a while. The actual income rounded was \$585,000.

In 2013, rounded it was \$517,000.

In 2014, it was 402,000.

In 2015, it was 480,000. And our current projection for this year, according to the current records is -- is \$412,000. Then I look at this year's budget. Again, I know you have to be conservative, but by how much? Again, we're budgeted for \$350,000. That's a long way below the average of those five years. And I know you can't know until the -- until, you know, you -- you find out what your cut is going to be. I know it's an unknown. It just seems to me -- and I won't belabor this, but I think that you have to look at past numbers and be a little more realistic and still be conservative.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: And you really can't. You really can't look at past numbers because you really -- as you attested to, you don't know. You don't know how much mortgage tax we're going to end up with. You don't know how much homes will be built. You have no idea how many will be bought and sold. We can't anticipate that. We know there is applications at the Planning Board for some things, but are they going to be sold? What -- we -- we have no idea. It's a complete unknown, and that's one of those things, if you don't budget conservatively on, and you get stunned by it, where is the money coming from?

MS. BORGUS: I know. Conservative is fine, but to a degree.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Well, let me ask you, what would your suggestion that that number be?

MS. BORGUS: Well, I certainly --

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Based on your theory, what would the number be?

MS. BORGUS: You still could put another 25,000 on. I know that's peanuts when you look at this budget, but that -- you could make that 375 and you would still be far below what the average of those five years is, a long way below.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: How many new subdivisions are coming? I know you go to the Planning Board, so I --

MS. BORGUS: One I have heard of.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Then you go back a couple years ago, how many years ago to a subdivision with 282 homes. I don't see that coming into the Town.

MS. BORGUS: You don't have room.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: We have the room, but we don't have the infrastructure. We have plenty of room, but not the infrastructure, meaning the sewers, which is a very important part of that. We have water, but not the sewers. Now, with water, you have to have a certain size lot. It has to be a minimum size. With a subdivision you can fit a lot more homes than that.

MS. BORGUS: Certainly.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: You have one approved on Archer Road, it went through the whole process but they're not going to build it.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: There are factors that come into it. You have to look at the whole picture and not just a little piece of it. That is why I think we're doing our due diligence when it comes to that.

MS. BORGUS: Let's look at the sales tax revenue on that.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: I'm with you, Dorothy (Borgus), on that. Let's go.

MS. BORGUS: 01.1115, and that, I believe, on page 2. Again, I went back to 2012. And again, I will round, just because numbers are so hard to listen to and grasp especially when you don't have them in front of you. The actual was 1 -- \$1,942,000. Rounded.

In 2013, it was \$2,077,000.

In 2014, it was \$2,018,000.

In 2015, it was \$2,149,000.

And the final projection for -- current projection for this year is at 2,063,000. The budget -- look at the budget. 1 million 500. That's over a half a million dollars less --

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Right.

MS. BORGUS: -- than historical income average for each of the last five years.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Gas prices.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Again, that's one of those areas we have no idea what our share of the sales tax will be.

MS. BORGUS: But can we be that far -- a half million dollars off?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Sure.

MS. BORGUS: A half?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Easily.

MS. BORGUS: I -- I worked with numbers for years, and to me, I'm -- I'm not going to take everybody's time up with it. I think you have got to be realistic. You have got to be

realistic.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Give us a number.

MS. BORGUS: I -- I'm not -- this is your job.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: I know, but it is easy to criticize.

MS. BORGUS: You know, it's not easy to criticize. This takes me hours and hours. I do it because nobody else probably in this room or the Town even has taken the time to spend two days to go through what I go through to come here and voice their -- what I think should be everybody's concern.

So maybe it doesn't -- it does matter to people. And when we get to the last thing I'm going to mention, I'm going to prove it -- it should be everybody's concern.

Now, let's move on to revenue. 02.0232, snow and ice removal.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Come on, Dan (Knapp), you're slipping. You got a page number, buddy?

MS. BORGUS: I don't have one on that one. I should, but I don't. Anyway, I'll move on. In the -- the actual -- here is another one.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Page 65, I believe.

MS. BORGUS: Everybody got it?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Which -- which account again?

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Snow and ice.

MS. BORGUS: 2302, snow and ice revenue.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Oh, I'm sorry.

MS. BORGUS: Got that?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Yes.

MS. BORGUS: The actual, in 2014, as you can see, was \$620,542.

In '15, it was \$628,623. Pretty close. Yet, the same number has been used for that account year in and year out at 455,000. It almost looks like nobody even looks at it. They just plugged that number in every year. How can you have the same number in a budget every year and be, you know -- hundreds of thousands of dollars off. It sure looks like nobody looks at it.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I am going to ask Mr. Lindsay, because -- this is part of his budget. David (Lindsay), if you would, please?

DAVID LINDSAY: Sure. Those revenues are based on contracts that we have with the New York State DOT and Monroe County DOT. The money you see in this budget is the general typical winter. The years you're referencing, Dorothy (Borgus), are for two winters where we received extra funds after the winter was over for the extreme winters that we had and both would have been 2014/'15 and 2013/'14 years. So it was over and above the contract amount that we had and they gave us extra monies for that.

MS. BORGUS: Well, I -- I think I'll go back and look at budgets before this then, because those two years -- that particular account I went back the two years that was on -- on the preliminary budget. But again, I think, um, I -- I -- I think it would show that every year is -- it -- it looks pretty phony, I guess is -- I don't know what other word to put on it when you have the same budget every year no matter what your experience has been, what you anticipate. It is always just -- just plug in that same number year in and year out, the same number. It would be nice to alter it a little bit any ways to make the cut -- make the residents think that somebody was really, really looking at past numbers. That's the purpose of this budget, is to look at the past and to try to estimate going forward, and to me, it looks like past numbers aren't used.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Dorothy (Borgus), actually they do. They are looked at. I know Mr. Lindsay meets with New York State and Monroe County DOTs a few different times throughout the year. Not only Dave Lindsay, but every Town in Monroe County, and they discuss snow and ice. They discuss alternatives for instead of using just salt. They discuss other items that they could use that would help with the ice removal from the roads. So they do take this very seriously. They do meet to discuss it. Not just within the Town, but across the -- the County, across New York State.

Mr. Lindsay belongs to a couple different organizations where they discuss this. And they're always looking for ways to improve the service to our constituents. I know that he takes great pride in what he does, and the service that he provides, and I take -- I feel very confident when I walk to another Town, go to another area, and see what they do, and look at what we do, and just knowing that they do take that time and effort to -- to make sure that a traveling public is safe. It's very difficult, Dorothy (Borgus) -- and I will defend them. I will defend this budget when it comes to that. You don't know. They're unknowns. You listen -- no, Dorothy (Borgus).

MS. BORGUS: You people put that number in there. He didn't. You did.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: We work with him on this to come up -- we come up with this together. And when you look at -- you listen to the news forecast. They change constantly with what is coming. Constantly with what is coming. And to anticipate what you need to do to respond. Whether it's calling in 4 drivers, calling in 15 drivers. We are constantly monitoring the weather. And to come up with a figure, you say that -- this just -- you're just throwing a number out there. Well, you have to start somewhere.

And I would -- if you can offer your suggestion on how we come up with a better number or better system, I welcome that. And I say this to you every year. Tell us. Show us your magic ball and I would be more than happy to.

MS. BORGUS: I think that it would make me feel more comfortable another year when I'm going to be standing here another year talking about the same thing and you talk about the wonderful job we did on snow, and I appreciate that, but we're talking budget here.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: We are talking budget. We need a budget.

MS. BORGUS: Would you please change some of these numbers even if it is just a little bit, so I will think somebody looked at them even?

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Next year I will.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I will, for the sake of everyone here, so that they hear this, this budget is looked at -- with -- with -- under a fine microscope, and I have to tell you, it starts with -- with Dan (Knapp) and I getting together and going over some of the numbers and the numbers that I require for us to balance a budget. Dan (Knapp) and I will go over those numbers.

Then we meet with the department heads individually. I do. One on -- and Dan (Knapp) and I together meet one-on-one with all of the department heads where they present all of these numbers that you see in that book to me for either my approval or disapproval or in any changes or modifications.

And as the Town Board can attest to, there are modifications made to that. Then it comes to the budget workshops where the Town Board has had their budget for a time period and they can sit down and ask their questions of me and of the department heads and of Mr. Knapp on a -- specifically what the needs were, why I cut something out. Why I may have added something else. Why these numbers. So to say anybody looks at this is definitely an illusion because it is looked at very, very carefully, and we try to be very careful with taxpayer dollars. Which we are all -- are, also.

So it is not fair to say it's not looked over and nobody looks at these things. That may be true for some residents out there. That is quite possible. I can't speak to that and I won't speak to that. But as far as we go, this budget -- you started out and said it yourself, and -- this is for the most part, a very good budget.

MS. BORGUS: On small things.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: We have done a lot over the past eight years, nine years, to bring this budget closer to reality. Every year we get a little bit closer. It takes time from where we were, because if you recall, years ago, these -- these budgets we'll call -- I'll call them a lot more conservative. There may have been a little bit more in accounts than need to be and the Town Board insisted that we brought some of these numbers closer to reality. We have done that.

MS. BORGUS: That's what I want know.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: It -- it's not perfect, Dorothy (Borgus). It's not everything is exactly where it is real, but there are some things we have to be very cautious of also. So if you're going to see the same numbers -- there is a lot of things in here with the same number. There is a lot of things with the same number the year before and year and before.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: But it's an average and best guess. No matter what number you put in there, you will never match it exactly because it's an unknown. It's an act of God, it's the weather, elements out of our control.

MS. BORGUS: But you said it, it should be an average. Some --

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Sometimes it is.

MS. BORGUS: And some of these are a long way off. For instance, State aid, let's talk about that, page 61. Account 02.351. Again, I went back to -- I got numbers here from 2013. Again, to round them to make it easy, in 2013, the actual was 172,000.

In 2014, the actual was 192,000.

2015, the -- the actual was 196,000. With \$140,000 budget.

This year, guess what? We're still at \$140,000 budget.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: You know why, Dorothy (Borgus)? Because what you left off is State aid/CHIPS. So our Highway Superintendents go up to Albany and they advocate for more CHIPS money for our roads and highways, and so what -- the State aid is only one portion of that -- if I'm -- if I got this right, David (Lindsay), it's only one portion of it. So they were able to get an increase in our CHIPS money in this year and several other years that put it up to that 196 or up to that 211. So that we're never going to know if we're going to get or not, but that is through advocacy work and them freeing up additional money for roads.

MS. BORGUS: Again, though -- again, year after year, always the same, the \$140. It gives me the same impression as the snow and ice revenue.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: The day you can guarantee what kind of money the State will give us --

MS. BORGUS: I'm not trying to guarantee it. I would just like you to hone in a little bit.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: We can't necessarily hone in -- you're talking about --

MS. BORGUS: You have a contingency fund if you're a little off.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: New York State, they have a formula for CHIPS and it's not a very good formula, because the year they did it, um, things changed after that and they haven't modified it. You have some smaller towns getting more money than larger towns. Also, New York State came out with a fund last year, a beautification fund so then they gave, you know, the municipalities across the State some more money.

Then this year, they came out with a Pave New York Fund.

And it all depends on an election year, you know, whether somebody in Albany says, "We're going to give you a little extra money to make you feel good, so you can tell the taxpayers I did something for you. Vote for me."

So it is very challenging for us to massage that figure and read their minds on what they're going to do. You think this is difficult to come up with, I invite you to go to a school budget

meeting where they spend millions of dollars more than what we do. And our tax rate here for Town of Chili is \$3.86 per thousand where theirs is going to be \$23, \$24 per thousand and they get all this different financial help and so forth.

MS. BORGUS: The school districts, in my opinion, are a mess, but that is because we have people who won't push away from the TV and go vote. It could be fixed.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I would like to keep this Public Hearing to our budget.

MS. BORGUS: Right. Well, Mr. Slattery --

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: I brought it up.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I'm just bringing it back in.

MS. BORGUS: Okay. I will talk about one more thing. And this -- this proves my point.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Okay. What page?

MS. BORGUS: I'm on fund balances, so there is no -- that -- it doesn't have a page, I guess. It's in the front of the budget.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Okay.

MS. BORGUS: That fund balance looked huge to me, so I did a little homework.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Which fund balance?

MS. BORGUS: The General Fund. The General Fund.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Looking for it.

MS. BORGUS: Certainly the Library hasn't got much of a fund balance. They're probably pretty nervous. I would be, too.

The fund balance from the General Fund, in 2013, it was -- and I actually -- this is right from the Town's records. \$1,912,000. Get that. Just under 2 million.

And in 2014, it was just about the same. 1,900,000. Rounded right off.

In 2015, it was 1,852,000 rounded. Those are pretty consistent numbers.

Now, let me get to 2016. \$5,842,000 -- I'm sorry, \$5,842,000.

And in 2017, by your own numbers here, it is still is \$5,488,152. A threefold increase between 2015 and 2016 and now this year.

If that -- that's to be believed, and I'm assuming it is, I mean -- you're audited and we have a very good person doing our financing -- finance records now. But what that tells me is that our tax rate shouldn't even be what it is.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Wrong.

MS. BORGUS: If there is that -- that much sitting in a fund balance, we ought to reduce the tax rate.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Okay. So in --

MS. BORGUS: We shouldn't be paying the taxes.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: So in two or three, four years when the State comes down and actually gives us a place to allocate the money that we have set aside for requirements that the State hasn't given us a place to put the money, we would have to raise taxes to bring that money --

MS. BORGUS: I follow.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: What is the current obligation on GASB, Dan (Knapp), do you recall -- actually almost 8 million, isn't it?

DANIEL KNAPP: Our financial statements last year was about 3 million. The full obligation is -- I would say \$12 million, but per our financial statements, it's about 3 or 4, in between there.

I will say, just to explain some of the difference between the million, two or whatever it was. I will say that going back a few years, the -- the amounts that we had previously -- the amounts in our fund balance that we had previously set aside and raised to account for OPEB obligation, that -- those numbers were just completely taken out and that is why you would have seen a jump. I started putting those numbers in there reflecting the true fund balance because this actually ties into our financial statements.

So if you -- the -- the -- the -- the beginning balance now ties into the financial statement fund balance that you would have seen for 2015 financial statements. But like I said before, I was just -- the -- the amount for OPEB was taken out and not even really displayed on here. So I just wanted --

MS. BORGUS: So you're saying that is a -- that -- it's a question of how you keep a financial record? The jump between --

DANIEL KNAPP: It's money that has more or less been -- it's been allocated already. It was not put in here because it has already been allocated out and kind of allotted for a specific purpose. The State has not allowed us to put it into a reserve or given us a vehicle, if you will, to -- to set that money aside into any counter reserve or anything else like that. So, in the financial statements, it shows up just in our general fund balance.

MS. BORGUS: So it's a liability.

DANIEL KNAPP: Yes, it is. It appears right on our financial statements.

MS. BORGUS: Well, I would like to just make one more point about the -- I'm -- I'm finished for today. But I just like to make one point for -- for those listening at home, if they get to see this -- this video, and the people who are sitting here in the audience, that they should know that when they come to the budget workshops, that's what they are, is a workshop. There is no opportunity. They are not meant to be an opportunity for the taxpayers to stand here like I am and ask questions. You listen. All you do is listen.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: At the budget workshops.

MS. BORGUS: At the budget workshops. But when you --

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I'll correct that a little bit. Because when we first started these, we allowed it. We allowed. And I recall there was one gentleman and yourself in the audience. That other gentleman and you, we allowed you to speak about and ask questions about things that were being -- that were being discussed. We allowed it.

It's not that we're -- it's not that we would necessarily disallow it, but there -- but the past several years there has been nobody there, so it hasn't been an issue. But I would say in the interest of public information, we would be more than happy to listen to questions. Now we won't get into this level of --

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Dialogue.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: -- dialogue for that, but we would certainly be more than happy to listen to what the residents have to say about any particular budget we're discussing. We have never denied our public the opportunity to speak. Never.

MS. BORGUS: Well, other than the last two years, I have been here. I was here all along.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I can only speak to the one year I recall you were here, again, with another gentleman and both of you were allowed to speak and talk about and discuss things that you heard.

MS. BORGUS: When you plan your meeting -- your workshops for next year, then, please remember to put a spot in for residents' comments.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Well, I think we keep -- and, Dorothy (Borgus), that's a good thought. I don't know that we would necessarily -- we don't put out an agenda, if you will. They are informal, so to speak. So we would welcome the public to come here. They're held in the summer, so come in your sneakers and shorts and t-shirts and whatever and be comfortable, but ask your questions. We have no problem with people asking questions. Done.

MS. BORGUS: I know this is a different time of year with the website, but it was really difficult this year to get the information and not come and sit here.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: And I apologize for the frustration you may have endured for the website. That turned into more of a project than we anticipated. Mr. Levey is working very, very hard trying to get it into the shape we need it to be in so I apologize for that.

MS. BORGUS: Well, there wasn't much of an opportunity because -- I -- I kept looking for it and was getting assured again and again it was there on the website.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: My understanding it was also there on the website when you and I had discussed it in the hallway. Had I known it wasn't, I would have been more than happy to provide you with a copy of the budget to look at.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: If there are no other comments from the audience, I would have to say this is my 16th -- 14 -- I get confused how many years. I have to say that this process has gotten more and more fine-tuned as the Supervisor had alluded to. There is a lot of effort and work that goes into this. It is not an easy thing. So I'm kind of a little offended sometimes, but I can understand where Dorothy (Borgus) is coming from, that certain numbers are in there and it looks like we just made it easy and it's a cake walk because we left those numbers in, but what it is is actually a barometer. To me, it's a barometer. If I see \$140,000 and I know that is the average of what we anticipate and if we go above and it says State aid and CHIPS, then I can clap and cheer because it's above what we had hoped for.

So there are certain ways to look at that, but that is how I look at that one section about State aid and CHIPS. And again, just about how well the budget was done, this is the -- only the second year that they presented the budget to us and we grill them with lots of questions. They never know what questions we're going to have year to year, budget to budget.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: What? Only the second?

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: We ask the department heads lots of questions. They never know what questions we're coming in with. It's a complete open workshop when we get together to talk about it. This is only the second year we did not have any changes from the Town Board for the numbers that were presented to us. They were able to answer all of our questions. So I -- so I'm just complimenting.

What did I say that you didn't understand?

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: That's okay.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Okay. I used "Mary" speak.

The Public Hearing was closed at 7:59 p.m.

At this point, a Public Forum was conducted to allow public speakers to address the Town Board. The following speaker addressed the Town Board on various subjects: Dorothy Borgus.

MS. BORGUS: I just want to know what CDBG stands for.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: CDBG? I will answer that now. Community Development Block Grant. It's a County grant. How'd we do?

The Public Forum concluded at 8:00 p.m.

MATTERS OF THE SUPERVISOR:

New Matters:

1. CDBG Hubbard Park \$35,000.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: The CDBG grant is a County grant that we get -- we try -- we apply for every year and pretty much we have gotten it every year. Goes back and forth from a different variety of projects. But these particular grants are set aside for low-to-moderate income areas of the Town. They could use some type of improvements. And sometimes we have done it in our parks. Sometimes we put in sidewalks. We have done a variety of different things that our community benefits from, but again it is in low-to-moderate-income neighborhoods.

This year we're getting a \$35,000 grant for some work over in Hubbard Park and I believe that's the courts; is that right, the tennis courts this year?

DAVID LINDSAY: Resurfacing the courts over there.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: So that is what that is -- it's a County grant.

Also, I would like to ask the Town Board, and I apologize for -- tonight for not -- we can't use our iPads this evening, and what we come to find out this week is we started adding information or continuing to add information to the Dropbox we're using. We have been using a free version of Dropbox which saves the Town money. There is no budget line item for that particular thing. But may -- may end up being one.

I'm asking the Town Board at this time what you would like to do. If you find Dropbox to be useful and handy, we really need more room in order to keep the history in there we have been maintaining. It is \$100 a year for this service if you would like to continue to use it. Or if you would like to see some historical information be removed from Dropbox and be -- that would be retained here where you wouldn't have 24 hour/7 access to do it.

So either spend 100 and increase so we get unlimited space or start deleting some stuff out of the Dropbox file.

COUNCILMAN DECORY: \$100 total?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: For the year, annual.

COUNCILMAN DECORY: For everything?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: For the Dropbox we use. We have a shared account.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: What account would that Dropbox come out of?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: That would come out of Mr. Levey's account 01 -- no. It would come out of the MIS.

COUNCILMAN DECORY: I have to say I like the ability to access the historical information on -- on a moment's notice.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Me, too. For \$100.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: To me it's a no-brainer, but I have to ask.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Do we have the money in the contingency account this year?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: He may have to wait until next year's contingency, but we'll make it work.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: I'm fine with that.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: What you got on you?

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: We'll take a collection. (Laughter.)

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: So you want to continue that. Okay.

The other thing, this was brought up in a conversation that I just wanted to mention this, seeing that we have a -- an audience here this evening and certainly people that may be at home. We have asked Mr. Lindsay to do a comprehensive article on ash trees in the Town for the next newsletter which we'll be doing it -- completing it at the end of November. So we'll see this in mailboxes sometime in December. But we wanted to issue what you should expect, what you expect, what we do, what you should do, what the County might do, what the State might do. We would like some kind of comprehensive ID so you have it all in one area so you know who to call for what perhaps if you have an issue with that, ash trees, which is becoming a bigger problem almost -- almost daily. There is other issues.

So Mr. Lindsay will be putting that together for the next newsletter and I would ask you to please -- hopefully you're already in the newsletter. Hopefully you're all getting it so you can see exactly what it -- what it entails. So I know that was a question that the Board had for me, so we will be working on that.

Also, I would just like to announce, and I mentioned this once a little while back, but I would just like to remind everybody on Tuesday, November 1st from 10 a.m. to 2 p.m., our good friends at Lifetime Assistance will be holding a community shred day. They will be -- for free. If you have documents and things that need to be shredded, you can take them over there and they will shred them through classified scanning and shredding. They are a certified and bonded shredding operation. So you if you have any documents that need to be shredded, feel free to take it over there and it will cost you absolutely nothing. 10 a.m. to 2 p.m. on November 1st.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: The location?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Oh, thank you. Good idea. I just assume everybody knows where Lifetime Assistance -- Lifetime Assistance is located at 425 Paul Road, which is a little east of here, down -- down Paul Road.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Near Marshall.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: So -- so hopefully you can take advantage of that.

Additionally, I would just like to mention that -- for those of you who might be hungry on

Saturday, your -- your favorite chef in the Town will be cooking for the Chili Fire Department Explorers' group as they're doing a fund raiser, and yours truly will be out cooking a pasta dinner for them. So if you're hungry Saturday between 4:30 and 6:30, stop in and get a nice inexpensive plate of pasta and meatballs.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Where?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I'm getting there. I'm getting there.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: I'm sorry. I jumped the gun.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Stealing my material.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I know. Again.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Sorry.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: That will be at company Number 1 on Chili Avenue, which is located right next to the Senior Center. So please -- please consider supporting our -- our Explorers. They're a great group of young men -- young men and women. I almost blew that, Mike (Slattery).

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Big trouble.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Also, a little change in some of the venue that -- you know we used to do the Family Fun Day and the Halloween thing -- were you going to talk about this at all?

COUNCILMAN DECORY: No.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Okay. Then I will. The Chili Fall Festival which includes some of our Halloween activities as well as a Family Fun Day, is Saturday, October 22nd. And that will be at Davis Park, so we're all good. And -- I just beat you to it. Running from 12 o'clock to 3 o'clock.

And again, that is in Davis Park. There is no cost for that. It is always well attended and a lot of fun.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: That is where the kids get dressed up in costumes. Just wonderful. Wonderful the creativity.

Pending Matters:

1. Vacancy BAR (2-Perm & 1-Temp Member) Committee, Ethics Committee.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: That's all I have under pending matters. We do still have -- we have actually two vacancies now on the Board of Assessment Review. And one for -- temporary member and also a -- we're looking for a member for our Ethics Committee. Anybody that might be interested in serving the Town in those capacities, please consider filling out a volunteer application. It is available on the website and I did confirm that that is still available on the website or you can contact my office and we'll be happy to guide you in the right direction.

MATTERS OF THE TOWN COUNCIL:

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: One question I have is why wasn't the budget able to get on the Town website?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I can't answer that right now. I don't know. I don't know. I -- I -- I can get you that answer. I don't know why it didn't make it there. It is my understanding that it did, so I don't know.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Was it on there at any point and then came off or just wasn't there to begin with?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: It was there to begin with. It was the -- if you remember at the last Town Board meeting, as our -- our attorney was so -- so kind to clarify some of my rumblings, um, that -- we mentioned that the tentative budget did make it to the website and it was on the website and at that time we mentioned that the tentative budget, because as Councilwoman Sperr mentioned it hadn't changed, we couldn't put the actual preliminary on there, but the tentative was a reflection of so it wouldn't have been any different.

Now, I don't know why it disappeared. I don't know. And it -- it may have something to do with the work Chris (Levey) is doing on it, on the updates. I really don't know.

COUNCILMAN SLATTERY: Thank you.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: I had a question for you. I had a resident ask me the other day, um, what happened. They signed up last year to receive like Zoning and Planning reports and they stopped getting them. And I told them I felt it might have had something to do with the website.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: It is. It is all a part of the updates they're doing to the server. To that whole process. We can't do the E blasts any more right now until this all gets straightened out. So the agendas, minutes, things like that people were getting automatically, newsletters, whatever it was, they were getting automatically has been halted until we can get the new server for the new website up.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: When do they anticipate getting -- can you give me a ball park?

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I'm not going there. I did that once before and I put my foot in my mouth. I was already scolded for that, so --

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Safe to say in a couple months if they have not started to get

anything maybe we ---

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: I'm not going to commit to a single thing on it. Eventual -- eventually it will be -- I don't even want to go there. It is being worked on as we -- not as we speak, but it is being worked on on a daily basis and I hope to have it up soon, but I can't --

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: When it is ready to go, let me know and I can give feedback to see if --

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: Oh, I'm -- oh, it is going to be well announced. I will send out a press release.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: I'm just trying to be prepared to have an answer.

And thank you very much for that ash trees. Because I live on Union Street by Black Creek Park and those forested areas there are just dismayed. There is a whole bunch of ash trees. They're all dead across the street from house. I lost several large ones in my yard. There is one that is in the right-of-way and I just talked to my neighbor tonight. It's 2 to 300 years old and it had died. It's overhanging the road. It is on Union Street, which is a County road, so the County will probably have to come and cut that one down. It is a shame. 2 or 300 years. So it survived that long. But people are starting to ask me and I don't have an answer, so that would be good to know.

SUPERVISOR DUNNING: David (Lindsay) will have them all.

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: Okay. Thanks.

The 9/14/2016 Town Board meeting minutes were approved as submitted.

REPORTS SUBMITTED:

Advanced Payment of Claims – September 2016
Architectural Advisory Committee Minutes – 7/12/2016, (No August Meeting)
Chil E-Fest Report – 2016
Chili Parks & Recreation Minutes – 8/23/2016
Dog Control Report – August 2016
Historic Preservation Board Minutes – 8/8/2016
Library Board Minutes – 8/23/2016
Monthly Financial Report – August 2016
Planning Board Minutes - 7/12/2016, (No August Meeting)
Recreation Revenue Report – August 2016
Senior Center Revenue Report – September 2016
Town Clerk Report – September
Traffic & Safety Minutes – 9/1/2016

CORRESPONDENCE:

1. Mrs. Ignatowski has received formal notification from Eric Janovsky, Recreation Department that he is resigning, effective September 28, 2016.
2. Mrs. Ignatowski has received formal notification from Robert Malone, Board of Assessment Review that he is resigning, effective September 30, 2016.

RESOLUTION #237 RE: Declaring October 16th – 22nd, 2016 “Freedom from Workplace Bullies Week”

OFFERED BY: Supervisor Dunning **SECONDED BY: Councilman DeCory
Councilman Slattery
Councilwoman Sperr**

WHEREAS, the Town of Chili has an interest in promoting the social and economic well-being of its employees and citizens; and

WHEREAS, that well-being depends upon the existence of healthy and productive employees working in safe and abuse-free environments; and

WHEREAS, surveys and studies have documented to stress-related health consequences for individuals caused by exposure to abusive work environments; and

WHEREAS, abusive work environments can create costly consequences for employers, including reduced productivity, absenteeism, turnover, employee health-related expenses and if left unchecked costly litigation; and

WHEREAS, protection from abusive work environments should apply to every worker, and not limited to legally protected class status based only on race, color, gender, national origin, age, or disability; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Town Supervisor and the Town Board of the Town of Chili hereby proclaim October 16th – 22nd, 2016 “Freedom from Workplace Bullies

Week”.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #238 RE: Contract with Compass Professional Health Services

OFFERED BY: Councilman Slattery SECONDED BY: Councilman DeCory

BE IT RESOLVED to contract with Compass Professional Health Services for Healthcare Price Transparency & Concierge Services for 2017 for an amount not to exceed \$4,500, pending attorney approval.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #239 RE: Periodic Assessment Roll Update

OFFERED BY: Councilman Slattery SECONDED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

WHEREAS, the Town of Chili has submitted a plan for Cyclical Reassessments in accordance with Section RP1573 undertaken its annual update of its assessment roll to maintain equity; and

WHEREAS, the Assessor has recommended the Town of Chili engage AVS Assessment Services; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, pending successful passing of the Permissive Referendum from Resolution #234, that the Supervisor be authorized to execute a professional services agreement with AVS Assessment Services to assist the Assessor with the 2017 Assessment Roll Update at a cost not to exceed \$7,250 and to include optional additional man days if needed at a rate of \$575 per day.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #240 RE: Flexible Spending Account for Town Employees for 2017

OFFERED BY: Councilman DeCory SECONDED BY: Councilman Slattery

WHEREAS, the Town of Chili Flexible Spending Account (The “Plan”) was adopted by an April 19, 1995 Resolution #203, and modified by December 11, 2013 Resolution #261 and maintained by the Town pursuant to Section 125 of the Internal Revenue Code; and

WHEREAS, the Town employees have found the Plan to be beneficial; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, to continue the Plan in 2017, open to full-time non-bargaining personnel and Union full-time personnel, subject to the bargaining contract, and open to employees working for the Town for a minimum of six (6) consecutive months; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the maximum for both Health Care and Dependent Care reimbursement accounts be set at the amount allowable by the Internal Revenue Code; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Flexible Spending Accounts will be funded from participating employee payroll deductions; but where the Health Care Flexible Spending Account may show a negative balance, the FSA shall be temporarily funded from the appropriate Employer FICA account and shall be reimbursed as participating employee deductions are received; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Town Board authorizes the Supervisor to enter into a contract with Lifetime Benefit Solutions, Inc. (Formerly EBS-RMSCO, Inc.) To administer the Plan reimbursements.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #241 RE: Set Public Hearing for Historic Landmark Status

OFFERED BY: Councilman Slattery SECONDED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

BE IT RESOLVED that a Public Hearing be scheduled for November 16, 2016 at 7:00 p.m. in the Town of Chili, Main Meeting Room, 3333 Chili Avenue, Rochester, NY 14624 to consider Historic Landmark Status for Cox Hall located at 2301 Westside Drive, Rochester, NY 14624. The tax account # is 132.13-1-35.12; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Town Clerk is hereby directed to publish notice in the Gates-Chili Post.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #242 RE: Penflex Inc. Agreement

OFFERED BY: Councilman DeCory SECONDED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

BE IT RESOLVED that Supervisor Dunning is authorized to enter into a Service Fee Agreement with Penflex, Inc. To perform standard administrative services for the Chili Fire Department, Inc. Service Award Program for the term November 1, 2016 to October 31, 2017.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

TOWN BOARD DISCUSSION RELATED TO THE FOLLOWING RESOLUTION:

COUNCILWOMAN SPERR: I know the Library is extremely pleased. Very pleased.

RESOLUTION #243 RE: Senator Ranzenhofer Bullet Aid

OFFERED BY: Councilwoman Sperr SECONDED BY: Councilwoman DeCory

WHEREAS, the Chili Public Library has been awarded an \$11,000.00 grant for Bullet Aid from New York State and Senator Ranzenhofer which is to be used to purchase new equipment for the Library; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, to increase revenue account L3840 (State Aid for Libraries) by \$11,000.00 and expense account L7410.2 (Library- Equipment) by \$11,000.00.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #244 RE: Clifton Fire Department Addition to Active List

OFFERED BY: Councilman Slattery SECONDED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

BE IT RESOLVED that the following individual(s) be added to the Clifton Fire Department active list effective October 3, 2016:

John Sosik

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #245 RE: Chili Fire Department Addition to Active List

OFFERED BY: Councilman DeCory SECONDED BY: Councilman Slattery

BE IT RESOLVED that the following individual(s) be added to the Chili Fire Department active list effective October 5, 2016:

Donovan Reilly & Jacob Wine

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #246 RE: Chili Fire Department Remove from Active List

OFFERED BY: Councilwoman Sperr SECONDED BY: Councilman DeCory

BE IT RESOLVED that the following individual(s) be removed from the Chili Fire Department active list effective October 5, 2016:

Justin Goetze, Jason Mulcahy, Abigail Phillips, Ben Plonk, Mike Reding

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #247 RE: Accepting the Final Draft of the Chili Center Master Plan

OFFERED BY: Councilwoman Sperr SECONDED BY: Councilman Slattery

WHEREAS, the Chili Town Board (hereinafter referred to as Town Board), has received from the Chili Center Master Plan Committee (hereinafter referred to as Committee), a Final Draft of the Chili Center Master Plan (hereinafter referred to as the Plan); and

WHEREAS, the Committee did provide a public review period, did post the Draft of the Plan upon the Town website, did conduct public meetings upon said Draft of the Plan, did provide a record of said public meetings held by the Committee; and

WHEREAS, the Committee has taken action to recommend the acceptance of said Plan; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Town Board does hereby accept the Final Draft of the Chili Center Master Plan and directs the posting upon the Town's Official website the Final Draft of the Chili Center Master Plan; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Town Board does hereby direct that two (2) copies of said Plan be provided for public review during normal business hours, with one copy being placed in the Town Clerk's Office and one copy being placed in the Town Library.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #248 RE: Employer Medical Contribution 2017

OFFERED BY: Councilman Slattery SECONDED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

BE IT RESOLVED effective January 1, 2017, for the calendar year 2017, the Town will pay the following maximum contribution towards the health insurance monthly premium: Single - \$580.69; two-person - \$1,247.59; or family - \$1,408.50, and the full-time non-union employee will pay, by payroll deduction, the balance of the premium cost, if any; or if they wish to pay the Town directly, the premium must be paid in advance by the 20th of each month preceding the period coverage.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #249 RE: Bids for Sidewalk Plowing

OFFERED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

SECONDED BY: Councilman DeCory

WHEREAS, on October 3, 2016, the Chili Town Clerk received written sealed proposals for the plowing of sidewalks for the 2016/2017 season. The proposals identified a total cost for the main general sidewalk areas, and for Sections 1-10 of the Park Place sidewalk district. Three proposals were received as follows:

Jo-Ann Krenzer	
Bid Item #1	General Sidewalks
Bid Item #2	Park Place
Bid Item #3	Vista Villa's
Total Bid Amount	\$877.00

David Krenzer	
Bid Item #1	General Sidewalks
Bid Item #2	Park Place
Bid Item #3	Vista Villa's
Total Bid Amount	\$928.00

J. Scott Krenzer	
Bid Item #1	General Sidewalks
Bid Item #2	Park Place
Bid Item #3	Vista Villa's
Total Bid Amount	\$959.00

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, to award the sidewalk plowing bid to the low bidder, Jo-Ann Krenzer at a cost of \$877.00 per trip for general area sidewalks, the Park Place Sidewalk District, and Vista Villa's.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #250 RE: Letter of Credit Release #1 for Union Square Apartments

OFFERED BY: Councilman Slattery

SECONDED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

WHEREAS, that per recommendation of the Commissioner of Public Works and Town Engineer, \$61,372.94 be released from the letter of credit #1105828807 with Canandaigua National Bank for Chili Townhomes/Union Square, leaving a balance of \$42,966.74; subject to engineering fees and street light bills to the Town.

Councilman Brown - Absent
Councilman DeCory - Aye
Councilman Slattery - Aye
Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #251 RE: September 21, 2016 Abstract

OFFERED BY: Councilman DeCory SECONDED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

WHEREAS, January 4, 2016 Resolution #1 authorized vouchers to be paid September 21, 2016, by all Council signing a waiver form; and

WHEREAS, Council did authorize by a majority vote vouchers 22341-22355, 22357-22359, 22361, 22363, 22368, 22370, 22373, 22375-22376, 22381, 22406, 22408, 22410, 22413-22415, 22417, 22419-22420, 22422-22430, 22432-22440, 22442-22448, 22461, 22467-22470, 22472-22476, 22478-22485, 22487-22500, 22505-22513, 22515-22516, 22519-22575, 22577-22580, 22582-22583, 22585-22588, 22592 totaling \$432,432.40 to be paid from the Distribution Account as presented by Virginia Ignatowski, Town Clerk; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, to note for the record vouchers 22341-22355, 22357-22359, 22361, 22363, 22368, 22370, 22373, 22375-22376, 22381, 22406, 22408, 22410, 22413-22415, 22417, 22419-22420, 22422-22430, 22432-22440, 22442-22448, 22461, 22467-22470, 22472-22476, 22478-22485, 22487-22500, 22505-22513, 22515-22516, 22519-22575, 22577-22580, 22582-22583, 22585-22588, 22592 were paid from the following funds:

General Fund	\$	170,431.65
Highway Fund		186,110.87
Highway Equipment Reserve		75,000.00
Drainage District		389.88
Private Purpose Trust		<u>500.00</u>
Total Abstract	\$	432,432.40

Councilman Brown - Absent
 Councilman DeCory - Aye
 Councilman Slattery - Aye
 Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
 Supervisor Dunning - Aye

RESOLUTION #252 RE: October 5, 2016 Abstract

OFFERED BY: Councilman Slattery SECONDED BY: Councilwoman Sperr

WHEREAS, January 4, 2016 Resolution #1 authorized vouchers to be paid October 5, 2016, by all Council signing a waiver form; and

WHEREAS, Council did authorize by a majority vote vouchers 22514, 22594-22599, 22603-22631, 22635-22639, 22641-22645, 22649-22650, 22661-22665, 22669-22677, 22679-22693, 22698-22712, 22714-22740 totaling \$81,944.31 to be paid from the Distribution Account as presented by Virginia Ignatowski, Town Clerk; and

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, to note for the record vouchers 22514, 22594-22599, 22603-22631, 22635-22639, 22641-22645, 22649-22650, 22661-22665, 22669-22677, 22679-22693, 22698-22712, 22714-22740 were paid from the following funds:

General Fund	\$	56,475.88
Highway Fund		10,107.12
Library Fund		2,239.91
H56 Annual Assessment Project		750.00
Drainage District		97.81
Street Lighting Districts		<u>12,273.59</u>
Total Abstract	\$	81,944.31

Councilman Brown - Absent
 Councilman DeCory - Aye
 Councilman Slattery - Aye
 Councilwoman Sperr - Aye
 Supervisor Dunning - Aye

The next meeting of the Chili Town Board will be Wednesday, November 16, 2016 at 7:00 p.m. in the Town of Chili, Town Hall Main Meeting Room.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:15 p.m.

